# Chromatic homology, Khovanov homology, and torsion 

Adam Lowrance - Vassar College<br>Joint with Radmila Sazdanović - North Carolina State University

November 12, 2016

## Overview

- Chromatic homology is a categorification of the chromatic polynomial. Khovanov homology is a categorification of the Jones polynomial.
- There is a partial isomorphism between the Khovanov homology of a link and the chromatic homology of an all- $A$ state graph of the link.
- We show that the chromatic homology of a graph contains only torsion of order 2.
- In gradings where the partial isomorphism is defined, Khovanov homology has only torsion of order 2.


## Kauffman states

- Each crossing has an $A$ and a $B$ resolution.

- The collection of simple closed curves in the plane obtained by taking an $A$ or $B$ resolution at each crossing is a Kauffman state.
- The all- $A$ state graph $G_{A}(D)$ of $D$ has vertices corresponding to the components of the all- $A$ state of $D$ and edges corresponding to the crossings of $D$.


## Constructing $G_{A}(D)$



## Khovanov and chromatic homology

- Let $D$ be a link diagram, and let $G$ be its all- $A$ state graph.
- The Khovanov homology of $D$ is $K h(D)$.
- The chromatic homology of $G$ is $H(G)$.
- Both are bigraded:

$$
K h(D)=\bigoplus_{i, j} K h^{i, j}(D) \text { and } H(G)=\bigoplus_{i, j} H^{i, j}(G) .
$$

- Let $A=R[x] /\left(x^{2}\right)$ where $R=\mathbb{Z}, \mathbb{Z}_{p}$, or $\mathbb{Q}$.

Hypercube


Kauffman states


## Spanning subgraphs



Kauffman states and spanning subgraphs


## Kauffman states and spaces



## Spanning subgraphs and spaces



## Spaces for both



## Multiplication until a cycle closes



## The multiplication map

Define the $R$-linear multiplication map by

$$
m: A \otimes A \rightarrow A \quad m: \begin{cases}1 \otimes 1 \mapsto 1 & 1 \otimes x \mapsto x \\ x \otimes 1 \mapsto x & x \otimes x \mapsto 0\end{cases}
$$

## Partial Isomorphism Picture



## Comparing $K h(D)$ and $H(G)$

Theorem (Helme-Guizon, Przytycki, Rong - 2006)
If the length $g$ of the shortest cycle in $G$ is greater than one, then there is an isomorphism between $K h(D)$ and $H(G)$ in the first $g-1$ supported i-gradings and an isomorphism of $\operatorname{Tor} \operatorname{Kh}(D)$ and Tor $H(G)$ in the gth i-grading.

## Example: $3_{1}$

| $j \backslash i$ | 0 | 1 | 2 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 3 | $\mathbb{Z}$ |  |  |
| 2 |  | $\mathbb{Z}_{2}$ |  |
| 1 |  | $\mathbb{Z}$ |  |


| $\mathrm{j} \backslash \mathrm{i}$ | -3 | -2 | -1 | 0 |
| :---: | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| -1 |  |  |  | $\mathbb{Z}$ |
| -3 |  |  |  | $\mathbb{Z}$ |
| -5 |  | $\mathbb{Z}$ |  |  |
| -7 |  | $\mathbb{Z}_{2}$ |  |  |
| -9 | $\mathbb{Z}$ |  |  |  |



## Example: $3_{1}$

| $j \backslash i$ | 0 | 1 | 2 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 3 | $\mathbb{Z}$ |  |  |
| 2 |  | $\mathbb{Z}_{2}$ |  |
| 1 |  | $\mathbb{Z}$ |  |


| $j \backslash i$ | -3 | -2 | -1 | 0 |
| :---: | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| -1 |  |  |  | $\mathbb{Z}$ |
| -3 |  |  |  | $\mathbb{Z}$ |
| -5 |  | $\mathbb{Z}$ |  |  |
| -7 |  | $\mathbb{Z}_{2}$ |  |  |
| -9 | $\mathbb{Z}$ |  |  |  |



Example: $5_{1}$

| $j \backslash i$ | 0 | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 5 | $\mathbb{Z}$ |  |  |  |  |
| 4 |  | $\mathbb{Z}_{2}$ |  |  |  |
| 3 |  | $\mathbb{Z}$ | $\mathbb{Z}$ |  |  |
| 2 |  |  |  | $\mathbb{Z}_{2}$ |  |
| 1 |  |  |  | $\mathbb{Z}$ |  |


| $j \backslash i$ | -5 | -4 | -3 | -2 | -1 | 0 |
| :---: | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| -3 |  |  |  |  |  | $\mathbb{Z}$ |
| -5 |  |  |  |  |  | $\mathbb{Z}$ |
| -7 |  |  |  | $\mathbb{Z}$ |  |  |
| -9 |  |  |  | $\mathbb{Z}_{2}$ |  |  |
| -11 |  | $\mathbb{Z}$ | $\mathbb{Z}$ |  |  |  |
| -13 |  | $\mathbb{Z}_{2}$ |  |  |  |  |
| -15 | $\mathbb{Z}$ |  |  |  |  |  |


$\bigcirc$

Example: $5_{1}$

| $j \backslash i$ | 0 | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 5 | $\mathbb{Z}$ |  |  |  |  |
| 4 |  | $\mathbb{Z}_{2}$ |  |  |  |
| 3 |  | $\mathbb{Z}$ | $\mathbb{Z}$ |  |  |
| 2 |  |  |  | $\mathbb{Z}_{2}$ |  |
| 1 |  |  |  | $\mathbb{Z}$ |  |


| $j \backslash i$ | -5 | -4 | -3 | -2 | -1 | 0 |
| :---: | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| -3 |  |  |  |  |  | $\mathbb{Z}$ |
| -5 |  |  |  |  |  | $\mathbb{Z}$ |
| -7 |  |  |  | $\mathbb{Z}$ |  |  |
| -9 |  |  |  | $\mathbb{Z}_{2}$ |  |  |
| -11 |  | $\mathbb{Z}$ | $\mathbb{Z}$ |  |  |  |
| -13 |  | $\mathbb{Z}_{2}$ |  |  |  |  |
| -15 | $\mathbb{Z}$ |  |  |  |  |  |


$\bigcirc$

## Torsion in chromatic homology

Theorem (L - Sazdanović)
The chromatic homology of a graph contains only torsion of order two.

## The shape of $H(G)$

Theorem (Helme-Guizon, Przytycki, Rong - 2006)
Let $G$ be a connected graph with $n$ vertices. Then $H^{i . j}(G)=0$ unless $n-1 \leqslant i+j \leqslant n$, and Tor $H^{i, j}(G)=0$ unless $i+j=n$.

| $j \backslash i$ | 0 | 1 | 2 | 3 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 5 | $\mathbb{Z}$ |  |  |  |
| 4 |  | $\mathbb{Z}_{2}$ |  |  |
| 3 |  | $\mathbb{Z}$ | $\mathbb{Z}$ |  |
| 2 |  |  |  | $\mathbb{Z}_{2}$ |
| 1 |  |  |  | $\mathbb{Z}$ |



## The shape of $H(G)$

Theorem (Chmutov, Chmutov, Rong - 2008)
Let $G$ be a connected non-bipartite graph. Then the summands of $H(G ; \mathbb{Q})$ can be arranged in "knight move" pairs.

| $\mathrm{j} \backslash \mathrm{i}$ | 0 | 1 | 2 | 3 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 5 | $\mathbb{Q}$ |  |  |  |
| 4 |  |  |  |  |
| 3 |  | $\mathbb{Q}$ | $\mathbb{Q}$ |  |
| 2 |  |  |  |  |
| 1 |  |  |  | $\mathbb{Q}$ |



## $H(G)$ contains no torsion of odd order

| $j \backslash i$ | 0 | 1 | 2 | 3 |
| :---: | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| 5 | $\mathbb{Q}$ |  |  |  |
| 4 |  |  |  |  |
| 3 |  | $\mathbb{Q}$ | $\mathbb{Q}$ |  |
| 2 |  |  |  |  |
| 1 |  |  |  | $\mathbb{Q}$ |

Suppose that $H(G ; \mathbb{Q})$ is above.
$H(G)$ contains no torsion of odd order

| $j \backslash i$ | 0 | 1 | 2 | 3 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 5 | $\mathbb{Q}$ |  |  |  |
| 4 |  |  |  |  |
| 3 |  | $\mathbb{Q}$ | $\mathbb{Q}$ |  |
| 2 |  |  |  |  |
| 1 |  |  |  | $\mathbb{Q}$ |


| $\mathrm{j} \backslash \mathrm{i}$ | 0 | 1 | 2 | 3 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 5 | $\mathbb{Z}_{p}$ |  |  |  |
| 4 |  |  |  |  |
| 3 |  | $\mathbb{Z}_{p}$ | $\mathbb{Z}_{p}$ |  |
| 2 |  |  |  |  |
| 1 |  |  |  | $\mathbb{Z}_{p}$ |

Then $H\left(G ; \mathbb{Z}_{p}\right)$ has at least these summands.
$H(G)$ contains no torsion of odd order

| $j \backslash i$ | 0 | 1 | 2 | 3 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 5 | $\mathbb{Q}$ |  |  |  |
| 4 |  |  |  |  |
| 3 |  | $\mathbb{Q}$ | $\mathbb{Q}$ |  |
| 2 |  |  |  |  |
| 1 |  |  |  | $\mathbb{Q}$ |


| $j \backslash i$ | 0 | 1 | 2 | 3 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 5 | $\mathbb{Z}_{p}$ |  |  |  |
| 4 |  |  |  |  |
| 3 |  | $\mathbb{Z}_{p}$ | $\mathbb{Z}_{p}$ |  |
| 2 |  |  |  |  |
| 1 |  |  |  | $\mathbb{Z}_{p}$ |


| $j \backslash i$ | 0 | 1 | 2 | 3 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 5 | $\mathbb{Z}$ |  |  |  |
| 4 |  |  |  |  |
| 3 |  | $\mathbb{Z}$ | $\mathbb{Z}$ |  |
| 2 |  |  |  |  |
| 1 |  |  |  | $\mathbb{Z}$ |

The free part of $H(G)$ looks as above.
$H(G)$ contains no torsion of odd order

| $j \backslash i$ | 0 | 1 | 2 | 3 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 5 | $\mathbb{Q}$ |  |  |  |
| 4 |  |  |  |  |
| 3 |  | $\mathbb{Q}$ | $\mathbb{Q}$ |  |
| 2 |  |  |  |  |
| 1 |  |  |  | $\mathbb{Q}$ |


| $j \backslash i$ | 0 | 1 | 2 | 3 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 5 | $\mathbb{Z}_{p}$ |  |  |  |
| 4 |  | $\mathbb{Z}_{p}$ |  |  |
| 3 |  | $\mathbb{Z}_{p}$ | $\mathbb{Z}_{p}$ |  |
| 2 |  |  |  |  |
| 1 |  |  |  | $\mathbb{Z}_{p}$ |


| $\mathrm{j} \backslash \mathrm{i}$ | 0 | 1 | 2 | 3 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 5 | $\mathbb{Z}$ |  |  |  |
| 4 |  | $\mathbb{Z}_{p^{k}}$ |  |  |
| 3 |  | $\mathbb{Z}$ | $\mathbb{Z}$ |  |
| 2 |  |  |  |  |
| 1 |  |  |  | $\mathbb{Z}$ |

Suppose that $H(G)$ has torsion of order $p^{k}$ for some odd $p$. Let the pictured $\mathbb{Z}_{p^{k}}$ summand be in the maximum $i$-grading of any $p^{m}$ torsion in $H(G)$.
$H(G)$ contains no torsion of odd order

| $j \backslash i$ | 0 | 1 | 2 | 3 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 5 | $\mathbb{Q}$ |  |  |  |
| 4 |  |  |  |  |
| 3 |  | $\mathbb{Q}$ | $\mathbb{Q}$ |  |
| 2 |  |  |  |  |
| 1 |  |  |  | $\mathbb{Q}$ |


| $j \backslash i$ | 0 | 1 | 2 | 3 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 5 | $\mathbb{Z}_{p}$ |  |  |  |
| 4 |  | $\mathbb{Z}_{p}$ |  |  |
| 3 |  | $\mathbb{Z}_{p}$ | $\mathbb{Z}_{p}$ |  |
| 2 |  |  | $\mathbb{Z}_{p}$ |  |
| 1 |  |  |  | $\mathbb{Z}_{p}$ |


| $j \backslash i$ | 0 | 1 | 2 | 3 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 5 | $\mathbb{Z}$ |  |  |  |
| 4 |  | $\mathbb{Z}_{p^{k}}$ |  |  |
| 3 |  | $\mathbb{Z}$ | $\mathbb{Z}$ |  |
| 2 |  |  |  |  |
| 1 |  |  |  | $\mathbb{Z}$ |

Theorem. $H\left(G ; \mathbb{Z}_{p}\right)$ can be arranged in knight move pairs.
$H(G)$ contains no torsion of odd order

| $j \backslash i$ | 0 | 1 | 2 | 3 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 5 | $\mathbb{Q}$ |  |  |  |
| 4 |  |  |  |  |
| 3 |  | $\mathbb{Q}$ | $\mathbb{Q}$ |  |
| 2 |  |  |  |  |
| 1 |  |  |  | $\mathbb{Q}$ |


| $j \backslash \mathrm{i}$ | 0 | 1 | 2 | 3 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 5 | $\mathbb{Z}_{p}$ |  |  |  |
| 4 |  | $\mathbb{Z}_{p}$ |  |  |
| 3 |  | $\mathbb{Z}_{p}$ | $\mathbb{Z}_{p}$ |  |
| 2 |  |  | $\mathbb{Z}_{p}$ | $\mathbb{Z}_{p}$ |
| 1 |  |  |  | $\mathbb{Z}_{p}$ |


| $j \backslash i$ | 0 | 1 | 2 | 3 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 5 | $\mathbb{Z}$ |  |  |  |
| 4 |  | $\mathbb{Z}_{p^{k}}$ |  |  |
| 3 |  | $\mathbb{Z}$ | $\mathbb{Z}$ |  |
| 2 |  |  |  | $\mathbb{Z}_{p^{\ell}}$ |
| 1 |  |  |  | $\mathbb{Z}$ |

The universal coefficient theorem implies that $H\left(G ; \mathbb{Z}_{p}\right)$ and $H(G)$ looks like above.

## Progress so far

- $H(G)$ contains no torsion of odd order.
- All torsion in $H(G)$ must be of order $2^{k}$ for some $k$.
- It remains to show that $k=1$.


## The vertical map

- For a connected graph $G$, there is an isomorphism

$$
\nu_{\downarrow}^{*}: H^{i, n-i}\left(G ; \mathbb{Z}_{2}\right) \rightarrow H^{i, n-i-1}\left(G ; \mathbb{Z}_{2}\right) .
$$



| $\mathbb{Z}_{2}$ |  |
| :--- | :--- |
| $\mathbb{Z}_{2}$ | $\mathbb{Z}_{2}$ |
|  | $\mathbb{Z}_{2}$ |


| $\mathbb{Z}$ |  |
| :--- | :---: |
|  | $\mathbb{Z}_{2^{k}}$ |
|  | $\mathbb{Z}$ |

knight move pair
tetromino
with $\mathbb{Z}$ coefficients

## Bockstein spectral sequence

The $\mathbb{Z}_{2}$-Bockstein spectral sequence satisfies the following.

- The $E_{1}$ page of the Bockstein spectral sequence is $H\left(G ; \mathbb{Z}_{2}\right)$.
- The $E_{\infty}$ page of the Bockstein spectral sequence is $[H(G) / \operatorname{Tor} H(G)] \otimes \mathbb{Z}_{2}$.
- If the Bockstein spectral sequence converges at the 2nd page, then $H(G)$ has no torsion of order $2^{k}$ for $k \geqslant 2$.


## Bockstein example

- $H(G)=\mathbb{Z}^{a_{0}} \oplus \mathbb{Z}_{2}^{a_{1}} \oplus \mathbb{Z}_{4}^{a_{2}} \oplus \cdots \oplus \mathbb{Z}_{2^{k}}^{a_{k}}$.
- $E_{1}=\mathbb{Z}_{2}^{a_{0}} \oplus \mathbb{Z}_{2}^{a_{1}} \oplus \mathbb{Z}_{2}^{a_{1}} \oplus \mathbb{Z}_{2}^{a_{2}} \oplus \mathbb{Z}_{2}^{a_{2}} \oplus \cdots \oplus \mathbb{Z}_{2}^{a_{k}} \oplus \mathbb{Z}_{2}^{a_{k}}$.
- $E_{2}=\mathbb{Z}_{2}^{a_{0}} \oplus \mathbb{Z}_{2}^{a_{2}} \oplus \mathbb{Z}_{2}^{a_{2}} \oplus \cdots \oplus \mathbb{Z}_{2}^{a^{k}} \oplus \mathbb{Z}_{2}^{a_{k}}$.
- $E_{\infty}=\mathbb{Z}_{2}^{a_{0}}$.

Goal: If $\beta$ is the Bockstein map on the $E_{1}$ page, then we want to show that the rank of $\beta$ is the number of tetrominoes $N$ in $H\left(G ; \mathbb{Z}_{2}\right)$.

## The Turner differential

- There is a differential $d_{T}: C^{i, j}\left(G ; \mathbb{Z}_{2}\right) \rightarrow C^{i+1, j-1}\left(G ; \mathbb{Z}_{2}\right)$.
- It induces a map $d_{T}^{*}: H^{i, j}\left(G ; \mathbb{Z}_{2}\right) \rightarrow H^{i+1, j-1}\left(G ; \mathbb{Z}_{2}\right)$.



## The Bockstein sequence converges at the $E_{2}$ page

1. $\nu_{\downarrow}^{*} \circ d_{T}^{*}=d_{T}^{*} \circ \nu_{\downarrow}^{*}$.
2. On each diagonal, rank $d_{T}^{*}=N$.
3. $d_{T}^{*}=\beta \circ \nu_{\downarrow}^{*}+\nu_{\downarrow}^{*} \circ \beta$.
4. $\operatorname{rank} \beta=N$.

## Our example

| j\i | 0 | 1 | 2 | 3 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 5 | $\mathbb{Z}_{2}$ |  |  |  |
| 4 | $\mathbb{Z}_{2}$ | $\mathbb{Z}_{2}$ |  |  |
| 3 |  | $\mathbb{Z}_{2}$ | $\mathbb{Z}_{2}$ |  |
| 2 |  |  | $\mathbb{Z}_{2}$ | $\mathbb{Z}_{2}$ |
| 1 |  |  |  | $\mathbb{Z}_{2}$ |

Our example: $d_{T}^{*}$

| j\i | 0 | 1 | 2 | 3 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 5 | $\mathbb{Z}_{2}$ |  |  |  |
| 4 | $\mathbb{Z}_{2}$ | $\mathbb{Z}_{2}$ |  |  |
| 3 |  | $\mathbb{Z}_{2}$ | $\mathbb{Z}_{2}$ |  |
| 2 |  |  | $\mathbb{Z}_{2}$ |  |
| 1 |  |  |  | $\mathbb{Z}_{2}$ |

Our example: $\beta \circ \nu_{\downarrow}^{*}+\nu_{\downarrow}^{*} \circ \beta$


## Consequences

1. Chromatic homology $H(G)$ contains only torsion of order two.
2. Let $D$ be a link diagram with all- $A$ state graph $G_{A}(D)$ where the shortest cycle in $G_{A}(D)$ is of length $g$. The first $g$ homological gradings of $K h(D)$ have only torsion of order two.
3. Chromatic homology $H(G)$ is determined by the chromatic polynomial.

Thank you!

